

Appendix A - Decision Criteria

Issue being decided upon: Manea blockade, weeks 23-27

Decision Criteria	Evidence	NR Opinion	Weighting	Decision
a) Maintaining, developing and improving the capability of the network	Due to the deteriorations and poor condition of Manea bridge timbers, this is both a safety critical matter and a threat to the continued delivery of the timetable	Without intervention, existing speed restriction that already affect timetable delivery will persist, the risk of major failure affecting timetable sustainability increases and the risk for a safety related event will continue to grow	High	Take the access
b) That the spread of services reflects demand	In preparation for the access decision, a capacity study has been undertaken that allows NR to seek to accommodate as many operator aspirations as possible in accordance with the objective and Part D4.6.3		Low	Take the access
c) Maintaining and improving train service performance		Without intervention, not only will existing speed restrictions continue to affect timetable delivery, but the likelihood of incidents that cause more serious perturbation to the timetable will increase	Medium	Take the access
d) That journey times are as short as reasonably possible		Disruption in the short term will allow for the removal of ongoing speed restrictions which will in turn support a return to sustainable journey times in accordance with the WTT	Low	Take the access
e) Maintaining and improving an integrated system of transport for passengers and goods	Due to the deteriorations and poor condition of Manea bridge timbers, this is both a safety critical matter and a threat to the continued delivery of the timetable	Without intervention, uncontrolled loss of capability at Manea becomes more likely. This is not supportive of integrated service delivery at any local or national level of passenger or freight operators and will indeed risk contagion on routes to which services are diverted in response. This is also material in the context of managing performance risk.	High	Take the access
f) The commercial interests of Network Rail (apart from the terms of any maintenance contract entered into or proposed by Network Rail) or any Timetable Participant of which Network Rail is aware	NR's commercial position is not influenced by maintenance costs, which would in any case be inapplicable. Failure of this route in an uncontrolled fashion will affect a national artery for freight traffic and a key route between regional cities, and affecting travel to Stansted Airport. The impact of such failure will be material to NR's commercial contracts with regard to compensation (Schedule 4 cost approx £6m), but the impact of this in the current regulatory environment is less important than the wider impact to UK plc.	NR notes that the detailed commercial costs for any given affected timetable participant are not reflected herein and that those parties may seek to apply a different weight with regard to commercial impact NR motivation is more driven by safety than commercial considerations in respect of this decision	Low	Take the access
g) Seeking consistency with any ESG output.		No ESG consideration. Not relevant.	Neutral	
h) That, as far as possible, International Paths included in the New Working Timetable at D-48 are not subsequently changed		Not relevant	Neutral	

i) Mitigating the effect on the environment	The timeframes for delivery are constrained by environmental stipulations imposed by Natural England, that effectively prevent the work from being deferred beyond week 27 due to the impact of overwinter migratory birds and annual flooding the of the surrounding levels.	Given the limitations described, if NR does not move to undertake the work as proposed, the work will be deferred for some months and the likelihood of catastrophic failure will increase accordingly Such failure will result in extended loss of rail access and consequent impact of freight tonnage, with a likely increase in road haulage to and from Felixtowe port for container traffic and consequent environmental impact	High	Take the access
h) Enabling operators of trains to use their assets efficiently	The current WTT is established with the objective of maximising efficient operator resource usage, amongst others. Inability to operate the WTT as a result of catastrophic failure will therefore act against the interests of all affected timetable participants		High	Take the access
k) Avoiding changes, as far as possible, to a Strategic Train Slot other than changes which are consistent with the intended purpose of the Strategic Path to which the Strategic Train Slot relates		Not relevant	Neutral	
l) No International Freight Train Slot included in section A of an International Freight Capacity Notice shall be changed		Not relevant	Neutral	