

MTR Timetabling Panel Reference – HAL TTP/002

Application of Decision Criteria as set out in the HAL Network Code to MTR Access Proposals for December 2020 and May 2021

Decision Criteria Objective (HAL Network Code D4.6.1)	HAL Assessment
<p>To share capacity on the HAL infrastructure for the safe carriage of passengers in a non-discriminatory, efficient and economical manner in the overall interest of current and prospective users and providers of railway services.</p>	<p>When allocating Train Slots to MTR and HEOC for December 2020, HAL has done so in a non-discriminatory, efficient and economical manner by allocating the four available Terminal 5 Train Slots in accordance with (i) the legal entitlements of HEOC and MTR; and (ii) in accordance with the Prioritisation Principles and Decision Criteria as set out in the HAL Network Code.</p> <p>HAL has not yet made a decision in respect of the May 2021 timetable, as the offer date is 15 January 2021. In asking Network Rail to request that MTR rebid for four train slots to Terminal 4, the Decision Criteria were considered, and a provisional assessment of the current MTR bid as against them is set out below.</p>

Decision Criteria Considerations (HAL Network Code 4.6.2)		HAL Assessment		
		Relevant	December 2020 Access Proposal	May 2021 Access Proposal – Initial Assessment, no final decision reached
A.	<p>Maintaining, developing and improving the capability of the HAL infrastructure</p>	Yes	<p>It is not possible to allocate four Train Slots to Terminal 5 to MTR due to the capability of the HAL Infrastructure at this time. Due to the Platform 6 restrictions at Paddington, HEOC trains need to have additional platform dwell times on the Terminal 5 platforms for much of the day meaning that there is not sufficient capability within the HAL infrastructure between CTA and Terminal 5 to accept an additional four services from MTR.</p> <p>Overall assessment: the capability of the network cannot accommodate MTR’s Access Proposal. The best position would be for MTR to run four services</p>	<p>The Platform 6 capacity restrictions at Paddington are due to continue throughout the May 2021 timetable period, as they are in place to facilitate operation of the western mainline during the time that the Crossrail Project is delayed, [REDACTED]</p> <p>Overall assessment: the capability of the network cannot accommodate MTR’s Access Proposal. The best position would be for MTR to run four services to CTA/Terminal 4. For any other offer to be made, a Capacity Study needs to be undertaken along with discussions regarding the continued position of Platform 6 at Paddington.</p>

Decision Criteria Considerations (HAL Network Code 4.6.2)		HAL Assessment		
		Relevant	December 2020 Access Proposal	May 2021 Access Proposal – Initial Assessment, no final decision reached
			to Terminal 4 via the CTA however it would be possible to run 2tph to CTA/Terminal 4 and 2tph to Terminal 5 on weekday evenings and on weekends (subject to a timetable study).	
B.	That the spread of services reflects demand	Yes	<p>We understand that a majority of passengers are using the CTA station (rather than Terminal 5). Passengers can connect for free at the CTA for services to Terminal 5 (Heathrow Express or London Underground) and this adequately reflects and services demand.</p> <p>Overall assessment: MTR’s access proposal does not appropriately reflect demand. Four HEOC services to Terminal 5 and Four MTR services to CTA/Terminal 4 would reflect passenger demand. In addition, any connecting travel can be done for free using the ‘Heathrow Free Travel Area’. As in (A) above, it would be possible for MTR to run 2tph to CTA/Terminal 4 and 2tph to Terminal 5 on weekday evenings and weekends.</p>	<p>On current information, Terminal 4 is expected to reopen to passengers in June 2021 and it is therefore important that MTR services are running to Terminal 4 at that time because MTR services are the only direct rail connection from the CTA to Terminal 4. In addition, the MTR connection from CTA to Terminal 4 is in the Heathrow Free Travel Area whereas a London Underground connection requires a connection via Hatton Cross, which is not in the Heathrow Free Travel Area.</p> <p>Overall assessment: MTR’s access proposal does not appropriately reflect demand and would seriously disadvantage passengers. Four HEOC services to Terminal 5 and four MTR services to CTA/Terminal 4 would appropriately reflect passenger demand. Any connecting travel between services and terminals can be done for free at the CTA using the ‘Heathrow Free Travel Area’.</p>
C.	Maintaining and improving train service performance	Yes	Having a fixed timetable means train service performance is improved. It also reduces conflicts at Terminal 5 with HEOC operations. If MTR terminates services at CTA/Terminal 4, it will use its existing Train Slots and work within the existing timetable. Train performance would also be	<p>As for December 2020.</p> <p>Overall assessment: Train service performance is best maintained and improved by having four HEOC services to Terminal 5 and four MTR services to CTA/Terminal 4.</p>

Decision Criteria Considerations (HAL Network Code 4.6.2)		HAL Assessment		
		Relevant	December 2020 Access Proposal	May 2021 Access Proposal – Initial Assessment, no final decision reached
			<p>protected between services to Terminal 4 and Terminal 5.</p> <p>Overall assessment: Train service performance is best maintained and improved by having four HEOC services to Terminal 5 and four MTR services to CTA/Terminal 4. As in (A) above, it would be possible for MTR to run 2tph to CTA/Terminal 4 and 2tph to Terminal 5 on weekday evenings and weekends.</p>	
D.	That journey times are as short as reasonably possible	Yes	<p>MTR's original bid of 4tph to Terminal 4 fits into the existing Working Timetable. MTRs revised bids of 2tph and then 4tph respectively do not fit into the existing Working Timetable. If MTR's trains were to run to Terminal 4 via CTA they would run in their existing slots and connect at the right time with connections on the Network Rail operated mainline. The journey times would be short as reasonably possible due to the train times fitting in with the existing train slots. MTR's revised bids cannot be accommodated with the existing capacity at Terminal 5 and attempting to operate them would result in delays/congestion on the mainline and would not support the objective of shorter journey times.</p> <p>Overall assessment: Onward connection options for MTR passengers to Terminal 5 are good, when considering all relevant factors the shortest journey times would be achieved by having four</p>	<p>As for December 2020.</p> <p>Overall assessment: the shortest journey times would be achieved by having four HEOC services to Terminal 5 and four MTR services to CTA/Terminal 4.</p>

Decision Criteria Considerations (HAL Network Code 4.6.2)		HAL Assessment		
		Relevant	December 2020 Access Proposal	May 2021 Access Proposal – Initial Assessment, no final decision reached
			HEOC services to Terminal 5 and four MTR services to CTA/Terminal 4. As in (A) above, it would be possible for MTR to run 2tph to CTA/Terminal 4 and 2tph to Terminal 5 on weekday evenings and weekends.	
E.	Maintaining and improving an integrated system of transport for passengers	Yes	<p>Passengers and staff at Heathrow Airport have a choice to get services to CTA or Terminal 4 or Terminal 5. The current system works well and is supplemented by London Underground services. Heathrow Airport prides itself in working with our Train Operating Companies in delivering this integrated system of transport. Customers at Terminal 5 who require the MTR services can connect at CTA for free. This was always the case when Terminal 4 was open to passengers and MTR were running 2tph to Terminal 4 and 2tph as an ITT service.</p> <p>Overall assessment: the system of transport is best supported by MTR providing 4tph to CTA/Terminal 4. As in (A) above, it would be possible for MTR to run 2tph to CTA/Terminal 4 and 2tph to Terminal 5 on weekday evenings and weekends.</p>	<p>On current information, Terminal 4 is expected to reopen to passengers in June 2021 and it is important to passenger demand that MTR services are running to Terminal 4 at that time because MTR services are the only direct rail connection from the CTA to Terminal 4. In addition, the MTR connection from CTA to Terminal 4 is in the Heathrow Free Travel Area whereas a London Underground connection requires a connection via Hatton Cross, which is not in the Heathrow Free Travel Area.</p> <p>Overall assessment: the system of transport is best supported by MTR providing 4tph to CTA/Terminal 4.</p>
F.	The commercial interests of HAL (apart from the terms of any maintenance contract entered	Yes	MTR has contractual rights to 2tph to Terminal 5 and 4tph to Terminal 4. These rights were sold in good faith on the basis of MTR running 6tph in total as per the Crossrail Concept Train Plan, which would always include 4tph to Terminal 4. The rights were not sold on the basis of MTR running to	<p>As per December 2020.</p> <p>Overall assessment: the commercial interests of all parties are best supported by MTR running 4tph to CTA/Terminal 4.</p>

Decision Criteria Considerations (HAL Network Code 4.6.2)		HAL Assessment		
		Relevant	December 2020 Access Proposal	May 2021 Access Proposal – Initial Assessment, no final decision reached
	into or proposed by HAL) or any Timetable Participant of which HAL is aware		<p>Terminal 5 only. HAL’s position with MTR has always been that services to Terminal 5 would only run once MTR runs the full 4tph service to Heathrow Terminal 4 and is able to deliver an additional 2tph into Terminal 5. It is in the interests of HAL that connectivity for passengers and staff is provided to all terminals, so it is important that MTR runs services through the CTA to Terminal 4. There is no financial loss to MTR in running services to the CTA/Terminal 4 rather than to Terminal 5 as the journey between CTA and Terminal 5 is part of the Heathrow Free Travel Area. In addition, it costs more for MTR to run to Terminal 5 as opposed to Terminal 4, due to higher track access charges for using Terminal 5.</p> <p>HEOC has Exercised its Firm Rights to 4tph to Terminal 5 and due regard must be also given to its interests. It is likely that its commercial interests will be negatively impacted if MTR runs two trains per hour to Terminal 5 as HEOC will not be able to also run four trains per hour.</p> <p>Overall assessment: the commercial interests of all parties are best supported by MTR running 4tph to CTA/Terminal 4. As in (A) above, it would be possible for MTR to run 2tph to CTA/Terminal 4 and 2tph to Terminal 5 on weekday evenings and weekends.</p>	

Decision Criteria Considerations (HAL Network Code 4.6.2)		HAL Assessment		
		Relevant	December 2020 Access Proposal	May 2021 Access Proposal – Initial Assessment, no final decision reached
G.	Mitigating the effect on the environment	Not relevant.		
H.	Enabling operators of trains to utilise their assets efficiently	Not relevant.		

Note that because there is no conflict between the positions arrived at under any Decision Criteria, it has not been necessary to apply any weighting to them under D4.6.3 of the HAL Network Code.